Immigration and new media. “Diasporic radio”: a preliminary case based in Milan

F. Pasetti, ASK Centre, Bocconi University, Milan – pasetti.francesco@gmail.com

Abstract

Immigration is a structural dimension of Italian society and immigrants began to emerge as a "new" audience and a as “new” market for businesses. Multicultural media provides information to this new kind of audience, representing a necessary and indispensable basis in the process of social integration. Today they constitute the place of expression of cultural minorities in the sphere of public opinion. This paper analyses the emerging phenomenon of diasporic radios in Milano and its evolution with the purpose of defining both its positioning and its growth trends from a qualitative point of view. Moreover, analysing the concentrations of foreign communities in the city it aims to figure out links and relationships that the communities of immigrants have with the programmes under investigation. In conclusion it addresses the issue of the tension between audiences and markets to determine the likely role on the industry from a social and economic standpoint.

Keywords: immigration, media, radio, audience, public sphere

Introduction

Today, we notice that people, ideas and goods are on the move much more than in the past, even the recent past, and increasingly more rapidly thus upsetting and redefining traditional value systems and processes of identity construction. Indeed, in our contemporary world, the customary barriers – whether political, cultural or geographical – that previously restricted exchanges between different social groups have become more permeable (Karanfil, 2008).

The resultant globalisation can be interpreted as a complex and contradictory phenomenon (Urry, 2003), resulting from a continuous clash between local and global (Iwabuchi, 2002). The key factors determining the intensity of this conflict and, consequently, the social and economic dynamics of this new global age are, on the one hand, “transnational media transmissions” and, on the other, migration flows of people (Appadurai, 1996). For Appadurai, the encounter of these two moving entities produces, reproduces and distributes the foundations of a new form of global existence which characterises the contemporary world.

A key role in this process is played by the development of new technologies (Karim, 1998) which have contributed in affirming the central role of the cultural industry of the 20th century (Hesmondhalgh, 2007) and led to the popularity of electronic media at ever lower costs. On the one hand, the electronic media increasingly link producers and audiences beyond national boundaries, and on the other people who belong to the same ethnic group, religion or language, but live in different countries, are able to keep in touch originating a number of new diasporic public spheres (Appadurai, 1996).

In the light of this theoretical reference framework, the Italian case is particularly interesting for two main reasons. The first reason is the fact that migration in Italy is a fairly recent phenomenon, but very substantial: at the beginning of 2009 the number of legal immigrants in Italy was approximately 4.5 million out of an overall population which this year has topped 60 million people. This figure places Italy amongst the biggest ‘immigration countries’ in Europe after Germany and Spain. Statistical surveys show a trend of immigrants increasingly putting down roots in Italian society, giving rise to a mature and stable immigration model with a progressively greater impact on Italian economic and social dynamics: today, immigration is a structural dimension of Italian society (Caritas/Migrantes, 2008; 2009).
The second interesting element is the attitude of the mainstream media in the face of this scenario. The attitude of the mainstream media is still one of underestimation and closure; the result is a marginal and stereotyped representation of the migration phenomenon. (Binotto and Martino, 2004; Colombo ans Sciortino, 2004; CENSIS, 2002; COSPE, 2003)

With the increasing number of immigrants who settling in Italy, the need for information sources that differ from mainstream ones is growing (Fiorio et al., 2007; Napolitano and Visconti, 2008), and we are seeing the development of multicultural media along with public opinion spaces which are open to "the other", thereby representing an increasingly more meaningful alternative to the mainstream media offer in terms of content, organisational models and positioning strategies (COSPE, 2002; Maneri and Meli, 2007).

Social integration mainly goes through information, which is the first form of social inclusion and thus through the opening and re-configuration of public opinion spaces (Amin, 2002). Multicultural media in this sense are an expression of this opening (Maneri and Meli, 2007).

This paper falls within a broad project about disporic groups and media carried on by the ASK Research Centre. In particular, it analyses the emerging phenomenon of diasporic radios in Milano and its evolution with the purpose of defining both its positioning and its growth trends from a qualitative point of view. Moreover, analysing the concentrations of foreign communities in the city it aims to figure out links and relationships that the communities of immigrants have with the programmes under investigation. In conclusion it addresses the issue of the tension between audiences and markets to determine the likely role on the industry from a social and economic standpoint.

Multicultural Media in Italy – a brief overview

The category of "multicultural media" this study refers to originates from the work by Appadurai on the ideas of "culture" and "ethnicity" (Appadurai, 1996). It corresponds to the group of media outputs produced by and addressed to cultural minorities. In particular, this article focuses on the media which Anglo-Saxon literature defines as diasporic (Georgiou 2003, 2005; Karanfil 2008), i.e. “newspapers and radio and television programmes produced within the so-called voluntary migration diasporas” (translation from Maneri and Meli, 2007: 21).

The phenomenon of multicultural media is not recent and the radio sector was the first to understand the cues resulting from the growth and establishment of the migration phenomenon in Italy. It was however during the second half of the 1990s that these initiatives started to evolve. In April 2007 there were 146 multicultural initiatives in place that might be subdivided in the following way: 63 newspapers, 59 radio programmes and 24 television programmes. The phenomenon exists in almost all Italian regions, even though its geographical distribution is fragmented and irregular: the highest concentration of media products is located in the North and Centre, whereas only 10% of multicultural media is to be found in the South. In particular, the press is more concentrated in the Centre, whereas radio and TV are stronger in the North (Maneri and Meli, 2007).

According to the literature (COSPE, 2002; Browne, 2005; Georgiou, 2003; Maneri and Meli, 2007) the main factors determining the concentration of cultural media products in an area are:

- Numerousness of the foreign population
- Presence of important production centres
- Support provided by local bodies
- Presence of lively associations
- Capillary distribution of radio and TV stations in the area.

On the demand side, the element that characterises the media offer is the reference public, since the target audience consists wholly or partially of foreigners. This latter can mean either the overall group of “foreigners” in general or, more specifically, a particular national or continental
community. Local people too are often part of the target public of multicultural media products, which does not change or belittle their identity characterised as it is by factors such as cultural, religious, working and living conditions (COSPE, 2002).

These dimensions (i.e. “promoters” and target public) are represented in Figure 1 which shows the positioning of the multicultural media offer compared to the mainstream offer.

Figure 1: Multicultural Media vs. Mainstream Media

The two offer systems seem to show two “opposites” as regards the values considered; this is not surprising since multicultural media are often created to fill the information gap left by the traditional mainstream offer. Indeed, if the latter is addressed exclusively to a local public, the multicultural media offer addresses mainly people of foreign origin who live in Italy: the topics, language and privileged perspectives of these newspapers and programmes are essentially different from those used by the mass media (COSPE, 2002).

The result of this new offer is represented in contrast with that offered by the mainstream media. The multicultural media offer is fairly diversified in terms of topics, genres and formats used, whilst remaining consistent with the role undertaken by multicultural media in general: on the one hand, the medium aims at becoming a useful instrument for immigrants to deal with problems related to Italian legislation and daily difficulties, and on the other it aims at showing a different point of view on immigrants. The most frequent topics dealt with are integration, local cultural, social and economic activities, norms and migration. The voices are mainly those of migrants; immigrants are shown as active, positive subjects who encourage change (Maneri and Meli, 2007).

This diagram is made following the most classical communication model: broadcaster – message – receiver.
A Case Based Study: The City of Milan

**Foreign Communities in Milan**

About the 10% of the foreign population residing in Italy lives in the province of Milan, which makes it the Italian province with the highest number of resident immigrants. The percentage of resident foreigners amounts to 9.5%, which is 3% higher than the national average. This figure has almost doubled in six years, passing from 4.6% in 2002 to 9.5% in 2008.

The Municipality of Milan proves to be a large immigration centre with an incidence of resident foreigners of 14% of the total population; however, it is certain areas of the hinterland which witness higher increases, in particular the municipalities of Sesto San Giovanni, Garbagnate Milanese, Monza, Vimercate and Cinisello Balsamo. Representing the situation on a map of the Province of Milan, excluding Garbagnate Milanese, the other four municipalities are all in the North-East of the Province and, altogether, account for one fifth of total immigrants living in the province.

Figure 2: Distribution of Immigrants in the Province of Milan

---

2 www.demo.istat.it; data as of 31 December 2008
“This distribution fully reflects the suburban development of the metropolis which opens out in
two directions: North-East along an imaginary line joining Milan to Monza and Bergamo
towards the Triveneto area, and North-West along the River Sempione, heading towards
Legnano, Busto, Varese and beyond [...]”\(^3\). This second direction involves the municipalities of
Garbagante Milanese, Legnano and Rho, which rank amongst the top ten municipalities for the
number of immigrants in the Province of Milan.

At the provincial level there are 3 prevailing communities of immigrants: Rumanian Egyptian
and Filipino who account for almost one third of the total resident immigrants. The city of
Milan is witness to the growing relative importance of the last two communities mentioned, but
in this case the Filipino one ranks first with 28 thousand people, i.e. 5 thousand more than the
Egyptian community.

Figure 3: Foreign Citizens residing in the Province of Milan

![Graph showing foreign citizens residing in the Province of Milan]

Source: Processing of data from ISTAT – data as of 31/12/2008

Other communities are more numerous in the provincial capital than in the hinterland, in
particular Chinese and Sinhalese. The remaining groups, with the exception of Peruvians,
mostly live in the hinterland: the first places on the list are occupied by immigrants coming
from Eastern Europe, particularly Rumania and Albania, with more than 30 thousand and 20
thousand people respectively.

From the administrative point of view, the Municipality of Milan is subdivided into nine zones,
whose main characteristics are given in Table 1.

---

\(^3\) Osservatorio per le politiche sociali della Provincia di Milano – Cergas/Bocconi – IRS (2008). *Prendersi
cura*. Milan: Province of Milan. p.49
The distribution pattern of immigrants observed above at a provincial level (Figure 2) is found in this area: the administrative areas of Milan with the highest presence of immigrants are in the north of the city: zones 2, 7, 8, 9; all with a population of immigrants exceeding 21,000 units. In particular, zones 2 and 9 which record more than 28,000 residing immigrants and an incidence on the residing population of 20.6% and 16.8% respectively. These are in contrast with the City Centre zone, which ranks last for the number of foreign residents and last but one in terms of incidence of foreign residents out of the total (11.4%).

The data gathered is summarised in the following table and shown in the diagram. Analysis of the distribution of the main immigrant communities in the single zones aims at identifying possible links that tie specific communities of resident immigrants to an area where there has been development of media outputs.
As already mentioned, the Filipino community is the most numerous in the Municipality of Milan; one fifth of these people live in Zone 2, above all in the area around Piazzale Loreto; the remaining part is quite evenly distributed in the various districts of the city. Within this community, religion represents a key aggregation and meeting element. The Filipinos living in Milan are mainly of the Christian faith – Catholic, Evangelist or Pentecostal. This community is used to gathering in the churches belonging to these confessions, for example in the zone of the City Centre at the Churches of Santa Maria del Carmine or S. Maria della Consolazione, whereas in Zone 6 at the “Jesus is the Lord” Evangelist church near Via Bisceglie. A special feature of this population is that, unlike all the others, it shows a non-negligible presence also in the Centre zone.
The Egyptian community, second for the number of residents, is mainly concentrated in zones 9 and 2. One third of this population lives in these districts. This distribution can be explained by the specific geographic position of two institutions linked to the Islamic religion. About 80% of Egyptians residing in Milan are in point of fact Muslim. In 1980 the first mosque inside the region was built in Via Padova (Zone 2). It was in those years that the road became a privileged place to settle and open trading activities for many Muslims as well as a meeting place for the Arab community in Milan. The other Islamic institution is in Via Jenner (Zone 9) and also here the population of Egyptian origin is numerous. It is within the imaginary perimeter that limits these two zones that a good part of the Egyptian community has gathered. However, the great majority of this population is distributed fairly evenly throughout the various districts of the Municipality of Milan with the exception of the Centre Zone.

Instead, the distribution of Chinese residents tends to be concentrated in specific areas. As a whole, ¾ of the Chinese community residing in the Municipality of Milan live in Zones 2, 8 and 9. The symbolic and geographic expression of this concentration is Via Paolo Sarpi, which marks the geographic boundary between Zone 8 and Zone 9, which are the “historical” Chinese settlement area in Milan. In the last decade, the Chinese population has expanded towards neighbouring areas. This description is confirmed by data processed by the Chamber of Commerce which shows considerable growth in Chinese-owned trade in these areas.\(^4\)

The Peruvian community is evenly present in all nine districts. Also in this case, distribution follows two general trends which have already been highlighted: on the one hand, the low presence in the Centre zone and on the other a remarkable presence in the North-East area of Milan, zones 2 and 9. The boundary between these two districts is home to one of the main meeting places of Peruvians: the Church of Via Copernico. Not far from this church, in Via Termopili (Zone 2), there is another reference point for Peruvians, the Peruan-ità cultural association.

The community which rounds off this overview is the Ecuadorian, which is also last in terms of numerosity. This population seems to follow the settlement trends identified for other foreign communities. Indeed, about half of these people live in the North of Milan (47.3%), mostly in districts 2 and 9, whilst only 3% live in the City Centre.

All this can be better represented in the figure below with the details relating to the single communities.

Figure 6: Municipality of Milan, distribution of the main immigrant communities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Filipinos</th>
<th>Egyptians</th>
<th>Chinese</th>
<th>Peruvians</th>
<th>Ecuadorians</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

\(^4\) Processing of data from the Chamber of Commerce of Milan in the Business Register as of February 2009. Chamber of Commerce website: www.tuttocamera.mi.camcom.it
The Multicultural Radio Offer in Milan

The analysis of the multicultural radio offer in the Province of Milan refers to 7 programmes identified through a systematic search of the Internet, and thanks to the valuable collaboration of Alessia Giannoni (from COSPE). These programmes are:

- Babel Latinoamericando
- Le Strade di Babele
- Perù: anche italiana la musica della costa
- Romen Krlo
- Tining Sa Itaas
- Toubab
- Vivara

The study method chosen is that of in-depth interviews carried out for every programme with the respective editor.

For each programme, the following variables were taken into account:
1. Birth and history;
2. Coverage;
3. Target audience and language;
4. Resources and funding;
5. Ownership and management;
6. Format, genres and topics.

The programme order follows the broadcasting day and time during an "average week" with the purpose of providing a picture of the “typical” multicultural radio offer that can be listened to during the week in the Province of Milan.

Thursday 12.40 – Le Strade di Babele
This cultural programme directed and presented by Eugenia Foddai is broadcast every Thursday on Radio Onda d’Urto (FM 98.00). During the 80-minute live broadcast, a book or initiative chosen by the anchorwoman are the cues to discuss and examine questions dealing with intercultural matters. The point of view is prevalently cultural with the purpose of fighting against the stereotyped representation which the mass media give of migrants. The programme is fully consistent with the editorial line followed by the station. The target audience is consistent with the radio target audience, made up of Italians from the “antagonistic” Left; hence it is presented exclusively in Italian. Le Strade di Babele is produced in its entirety at the Brescia station. The making depends entirely on the efforts of the anchorwoman, who receives no remuneration for the work. The economic resources of the programme, as well as those of the entire station, are linked to two sources of finance: the main source, (roughly 80% of the budget) is revenue from the Radio Onda d’Urto Festival, the remaining 20% from subscriptions through a formula of 6 euro per month as financial support for the station.

Thursday 18.10 - Perù: anche italiana la musica della costa
The title of the programme broadcast on Radio Meneghina (FM 91.95), refers to the coast, site par excellence for migrants. The format is that of a music programme alternating music and interludes dedicated to current affairs and the frequently intertwined histories of Italy and Peru.

In particular, the study focused on the multicultural radio programmes broadcast from 20 August to 18 October 2009 within the boundaries of the Province of Milan. The annual programme schedule for radio stations is normally subdivided into two time periods: the first one, generally from October to June and the second from July until the end of September. These two time periods often coincide with different programme schedules. The reference timeframe was therefore chosen to make it possible to identify multicultural products existing in both periods.
The programme was born with the idea of dealing with the Italian community who emigrated to Peru, by looking at the whole Italian community in the world, to later extend its scope to involve the Peruvian community in Italy and the rest of the world. The target audience takes into account the listeners of Radio Meneghina which addresses the areas of Lombardy and Ticino, but also those who listen to the programme on the web: via the Radio Meneghina website or on the portal of the Peruan-ità Italian-Peruvian Association. This non-profit association is strongly tied with the programme; both are complementary aspects of the same project. A common goal which is shared also by the people involved: programme authors and presenters are the main representatives of the association. The making of the programme depends on their efforts, together with that of all the other people involved in it, plus their personal sustaining of production and broadcasting costs.

Friday 8.15 – Toubab
This programme run by Claudio Agostoni on Radio Popolare (FM 107.60) it is a cultural debate dedicated to the world of immigration, in particular to everyday stories and facts usually forgotten by the media. The programme bank on thirty Italian and foreign collaborators, who, unlike the authors, collaborate voluntarily, and once in a while receive an “attendance” fee. The target audience is in line with the radio target, which is made up of middle-class Italian citizens, aged 30 to 50 who invest in culture. It is presented entirely in Italian, partly because of the target audience, but above all because of a political choice of the Milanese station which, after having experimented with programmes in foreign languages, sees native languages as a potential factor of segregation and closure. The programme budget is limited: costs are borne fully by Radio Popolare. Two main sources account for 80% of the radio budget: half of the revenue comes from advertising, the other half from subscriptions, which are a fairly uncommon financial source in the radio sector. Advertisers must be in line with the editorial policy and target audience of the radio, the majority of products advertised within Toubab are cultural and linked to the world of immigration.

Friday 20.30 - Tining Sa Itaas
The programme was developed with exclusively religious purposes linked to the Evangelist church of Filipino origin, “Jesus is The Lord”, which has its headquarters and place of worship in the Bicceglie area, West Milan. The declared purpose is that of evangelization and this determines the choice of the programme topics, which are mainly prayers, Christian songs and some comments from the listeners. The target community is the Filipino one and the languages used are the official ones of the Philippines: Filipino(prevalently) and English. The programme broadcast its last episode on 25 September 2009. Indeed, the programme changed its broadcasting platform, up until that point it was on-air on Radio Meneghina every Friday evening from 8.30 to 10.30pm and on-line on the radio website and on www.jilchurchitaly.com; it is now available only on the web as of October 20096. Since the majority of the listeners followed the programme on-line savings became possible in terms of production costs and so the programme decide to broadcast only on the web. In addition to this, the web offers much wider margins of autonomy and freedom compared to the radio. Tining Sa Itaas, like other programmes observed, is closely linked to an association which represents an important reference point in organisational and managerial terms. In this case the media output is an integral part of the Jesus is The Lord Association, specifically of the "media ministry" of the organisation. The entire budget of the programme and all the collaborators are financed by the organisation that establishes also the editorial line and the programme schedule.

Saturday 14.00 - Roman Krlo
The programme edited and presented by Bayram Ozmani and broadcast on Radio Onda d’Urto, started in September in 1994 with the purpose of becoming a liaison point for the Rom community in the world.

6 I decided to include it anyway in my research because it was active when I started planning my interviews and furthermore it features unique and extremely interesting characteristics.
It lasts approximately 90 minutes and its target audience is represented by the Rom community in general, also beyond the Italian borders. Indeed, in addition to the frequencies modulated for the radio, the programme is digitally broadcast via satellite (Hotbird and Panamasat) and on-line on the RTV Nisava website (www.nisava.org), the main radio and TV station of this community in Serbia. The programme has a format that alternates cultural debate, news, service information and a little traditional Rom music; the programme is interspersed with live contributions above all from journalists, politicians, intellectuals from all over Europe, who take turns at the microphones of Roman Krlo to deal with matters of interest for this community. The language most frequently used is Romeni, which is often alternated with other languages. Also in this case, the programme is made exclusively thanks to the (voluntary) work and passion of its creator.

Saturday 18.00 - Babel Latinoamericando
This programme, edited and presented by Jeanneth Patricia Sousa, is entirely produced in the studios of Radio Marconi (FM 94.80) which broadcasts it live from 6.00pm, whilst one hour later, a recording is broadcast on Radio Onda d’Urto. It is also available on the web: www.radiondadurto.org, www.maximanet.tk, www.puyence.com, and via satellite on channel 904 of Sky. This programme too uses the format of a cultural debate containing several features, each one lasting about ten minutes. The creator’s declared purpose is to create an “intercultural link” between the Latin American world and Italian society, by highlighting initiatives addressed to the Latin American community in Italy. For this reason, the programme is addressed not only to the Latin American community, but also to the Italian listeners who live with it on a day-to-day basis. Babel Latinoamericando started in 2007 as Babel Latino thanks to a one-year funding from the Provincial Government of Milan. Once this funding was used up, the programme was able to continue thanks to sponsorship by the Gruppo Latinoamericando (it is a commercial network, established in 1991, specialising in the Latin world), after which the current programme was named. The entire budget is covered by this company which also sustains the main broadcasting costs. The sense of fellowship came out of the joint objectives and targets shared by the two projects. The topics, editorial line and advertising for the programme are established jointly with the editorial office of Gruppo Latinoamericando, with whom Patricia collaborates closely.

Saturday 20.00 - Vivara
Vivara closes the “week” of the multicultural radio schedule in the Province of Milan. On Saturday at 20.30, Vijit (the editor) and some collaborators broadcast a programme addressed to the communities from Sri Lanka live from the studios of Radio Onda d’Urto and in web streaming on www.vivaranews.com. The purpose of Vivara is that of supporting the Sri Lanka community living in Italy by keeping its habits and traditions alive and, at the same time, becoming a useful service instrument for these people to deal with the problems of living in another country. These aims define the programme contents: news and information regarding the political and economic situation of Sri Lanka, cultural debates, interviews, but also service information. Sinhalese and Tamil alternate live even though the beginning and the end of the programme are in Italian to “indulge” the Italian listeners of Radio Onda d’Urto which hosts the programme. The programme started in 1997 from a project of the Sri Lanka Italia Association, founded one year earlier and is, in a way, the “voice” of this association and the communities it represents: the Sinhalese and Tamil ones. The relationship between programme and target audience is very close because of the Association which acts as intermediary; the editorial line is established by the Sri Lanka – Italia Association, whose activities finance the whole programme budget.

The following table (Table 3) contains a brief summary of the characteristics of the programmes analysed divided in three groups, as later explained:
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ELEMENTS ANALYSED</th>
<th><strong>Group 1</strong></th>
<th><strong>Group 2</strong></th>
<th><strong>Group 3</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>TARGET AUDIENCE</strong></td>
<td><strong>Roman Krlo</strong></td>
<td><strong>Vivara</strong></td>
<td><strong>Tining Sa Itaas</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rom</td>
<td>Sri Lanka</td>
<td>Philippines</td>
<td>South America/Italy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>LANGUAGE</strong></td>
<td>Romeni</td>
<td>Sinhalese/Tamil</td>
<td>Filipino</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>AIM</strong></td>
<td>Community support</td>
<td>Community support. Liaison with country of origin</td>
<td>Evangelization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>GENRE</strong></td>
<td>Information Culture Music</td>
<td>Information Culture Music</td>
<td>Music Religion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>FORMAT</strong></td>
<td>Magazine</td>
<td>Magazine</td>
<td>Music and Culture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>PROMOTERS</strong></td>
<td>Radio Onda d’Urto Station</td>
<td>Sri Lanka – Italia Association</td>
<td>Jesus is The Lord Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>RESOURCES</strong></td>
<td>Volunteers</td>
<td>Private individuals</td>
<td>Private individuals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>STAFF</strong></td>
<td>Volunteer</td>
<td>Volunteer</td>
<td>Remunerated</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>STATION</strong></td>
<td>Associative</td>
<td>Associative</td>
<td>Commercial</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>PRODUCTION</strong></td>
<td>“Glo-cal”</td>
<td>“Glo-cal”</td>
<td>“Glo-cal”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>COVERAGE</strong></td>
<td>“Glo-cal”</td>
<td>“Glo-cal”</td>
<td>“Glo-cal”</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The following diagram summarises the positioning of the programmes analysed in the positioning matrix of Figure 1.

**Figure 7: Positioning of the Programmes Analysed**

Three groups can be easily identified:

**Group 1** is made up of three radio products: *Romen Krlo*, *Vivara* and *Tining Sa Itaas*, which share the fact of being produced by people belonging to a specific foreign community and are addressed to an audience of the same community. The choice of the language used for presentation follows the same logic. It being understood that the purposes pursued are quite different, the common shared desire of these programmes is that of supporting and strengthening their target communities, i.e. the Rom Community, and the ones from Sri Lanka and the Philippines respectively.

**Group 2** is made up of two programmes: *Babel Latinoamericando* and *Perù: anche italiana la musica della costa*; these are both characterised by the collaboration with Italians and immigrants in the production of the programme, and they are both addressed to an audience of Italians and foreigners, in particular South Americans. This positioning is reflected also in the languages chosen for the programme: in both cases, Italian and Spanish alternate and intermingle, breaking up the rhythm of the presentation. They both aim at becoming an instrument of cultural integration.

Finally, **Group 3** brings together radio programmes made by essentially “Italian” editorial offices, which do however receive a relevant contribution from collaborators of foreign origin. They are both cultural debates presented entirely in Italian and designed for a prevalently Italian audience, in line with the targets of both stations. The goal is to increase knowledge of the world of immigration and fight against the image of immigrants given by the mainstream media.

At this point, the analysis focuses on some elements which are particularly significant for the case under examination: on the one hand the promoters and sources of finance, and on the other, the production and coverage of these media outputs. The goal is to study the dynamics that identify the single programmes and contextualise them in the groups they belong to and, more generally, within the entire offer.
Promoters and Sources of Finance
Promoters, when present, provide a fundamental contribution for the realization of the radio programmes. The main types of promoters are associations and radio stations.

The latter are a specific feature of Group 3. As pointed out previously, Le Strade di Babele and Toubab are produced within their respective stations which sustain the production and broadcasting costs of the programme.

Radio Onda d’Urto offers its recording studios free of charge also for Romen Krlo and Vivara. In those cases where a fee is paid, as in the case of Radio Marconi and Radio Meneghina, the fee is normally fairly symbolic and there is, in any case, a close collaboration and involvement of the station in the projects carried on through the programmes.

To deal with this aspect in depth, it is interesting to observe the model of governance used by the stations under examination:

- Radio Popolare is a so-called democratic radio station, since it hinges on a cooperative of workers, collaborators and representatives of political and trade union forces who have historically supported the project.
- Radio Onda D’Urto is instead an associative radio, managed by a local cultural association: “Radio Onda d’Urto Associazione Culturale”, which was registered with the Court of Brescia in 1986.
- Radio Marconi is a Catholic radio of the Inblu network.
- Radio Meneghina, finally, is a commercial station managed by a limited liability company with a commercial licence.

Associations too play a key role in making the programmes and they provide a fundamental contribution towards their economic feasibility. “Peruan-ità”, “Sri Lanka – Italia” and the “Jesus is The Lord” religious associations are not only an economic and managerial reference point for their respective programmes, but they also determine their editorial line.

The last type of promoter found is a sort of sponsorship that ties the programme Babel Latinoamericando to the Gruppo Latinoamericando. This relationship is the result of a desire of the programme’s editor, Patricia Sousa, and of Juan José Fabiani, the group’s founder, to address the South American community, albeit with differing objectives. This relationship has specific commercial features: the programme is entirely financed by Mr. Fabiani’s company, which, in return, gains visibility for the initiatives produced within the Latinoamericando network. Also the editorial line of the radio programme is defined jointly in agreement with the promoting company. It is important to point out that Gruppo Latinoamericando is the only company in the radio scenario analysed that addresses the audience of migrants (specifically Latin American ones) with a market perspective.

Last but not least, the key role of volunteer work must be stressed both for the cases under examination and, more generally, in the multicultural media scenario, since it often represents the main resource in economic and managerial terms. (COSPE, 2002; Browne, 2005; Georgiou, 2003; Maneri and Meli, 2007). Programme sustainability is granted by volunteer work by all the people involved in production and broadcasting: with the exception of the editorial offices of Babel Latinoamericando and Toubab (which have forms of remuneration for both staff and collaborators), the staff involved in making programmes work exclusively on a voluntary basis.

Production and Coverage
Production and coverage dynamics are closely related and characterise the multicultural offer in a very specific way. However, some preliminary reflections are necessary in order to obtain a clear overall picture.

First of all, the consideration that radio broadcasting is often paralleled by a coverage on far-ranging platforms, such as web and satellite which can reach listeners located in different countries or continents. People not residing in Italy are often an integral part of the programme...
target which is carefully taken into account during planning. The definition of the target audience and the resulting positioning strategy therefore become more complex and have a “different” impact on production dynamics.

For Group 3 programmes, production and coverage can be defined as predominantly local. The target audience is made up of Italians living in the North-West of Italy, which is the catchment area of the stations. Internet and satellite are present as coverage channels, but they are not means to reach an audience that extends beyond these territorial boundaries.

What happens in Group 1 and Group 2 programmes is different. These media outputs deal, at one and the same time, with local and global aspects that affect both production and broadcasting. With regards to production, programmes have local characteristics, such as the reference to topics and facts linked to the place of production, and at the same time global aspects, such as the numerous connections that Romen Krlo has with the RTV Nisava group in Serbia; foreign editorial offices which are part of the Peruan-ità Association or the live contributions from Latin America of Babel Latinoamericando. All these examples are a substantial deterritorialization of the message and its production.

Coverage too is both local and global at the same time: local in radio programmes which cover the catchment area of the stations, global in the signal coverage thanks to long-range broadcasting channels that accompany radio programmes and enable them to boost the reach of the message in an incredible way. This international communication links members of the same community living in different parts of the planet and, at the same time, different communities living in the same area. This type of media offer can satisfy the numerous necessities of an immigrant which range from the need to keep in contact with the country of origin to the need to give a different image of its community to the Italian people (in the case of Italy).

The radio offer analysed therefore has a strong internal discontinuity: the five programmes of Groups 1 and 2 are profoundly different from those of Group 3 as regards production and coverage. Le Strade di Babele and Toubab are programmes produced and created by the station for a precise (local) audience in line with its editorial policy which never goes beyond the respective catchment areas of the stations. Indeed are not characterised by the internationalisation process that is instead present in other radio outputs. In addition to this, also the positioning strategy is profoundly different: taking figures 1 and 7 into consideration, it can be seen that the position occupied by Group 3 corresponds to the positioning of the mainstream media offer. In this perspective, the two programmes can be included in traditional media.

At this point, it is necessary to take a step back to clarify the issue better. In defining the subject matter of the survey, I decided to include Le Strade di Babele and Toubab in the group of multicultural media because they represent two radio products which were designed to satisfy the needs for information on immigrants in Italy, however, the survey gives rise to some doubts on this initial classification and leads to a reconsideration of the programmes of Group 3, owing to their unique aspects, as part of the mainstream media offer.

Despite the remarkable differences in terms of content, governance models, and positioning between the mainstream and the multicultural offer, it would be a mistake to consider them two separate and opposing sets. The phenomenon of multicultural media is only one answer to the role that immigration has taken on in Italy and to the importance that foreigners have in the Italian economy and society. As of today, the traditional media offer seems not to have become aware of this critical element (Binotto and Martino, 2004). There are few media initiatives addressed to immigrants and, more in general, focussing on immigration. However, these include the programmes of Group 3
which are a first step towards increased information plurality and, at the same time, are trying to fill the gap between traditional and multicultural offers.

In short, it can be stated that the three model groups identified reflect, on the one hand, just as many (alternative) ways of interpreting the adjective “multicultural” in the radio context and, on the other, three different answers which the overall media offer gives to the immigration phenomenon in Italy: Groups 1 and 2 being referable to the multicultural offer, Group 3 instead to the mainstream one.

This said, before moving on to conclusions, it is interesting to check whether the territorial concentration of immigrant communities has influenced the birth and/or development of the programmes under examination.

As a result, the focus returns to Groups 1 and 2 where foreigners make up the majority of the target audience. In general, no link has been found between the territorial concentration of immigrants and the radio outputs under investigation, with two exceptions:

- **Perù: anche italiana la musica della costa**, because the programme has developed in parallel to the Italian – Peruvian association which has its headquarters in Via Termopili, in the very heart of the Peruvian community settlement;

- **Tining Sa Itaas**, which has a territorial link with the community because it is based at the “Jesus is the Lord” church which is one of the social and religious reference points for Filipinos. In this case, the programme is not so much the expression of territoriality as a place where a specific foreign community has concentrated, but rather territoriality as a place where there is a reference organisation or institution.

These programmes are similar in their link with the respective communities: it is the organisation itself which acts as an intermediary between community and programme.

**Conclusions**

The analysis of the multicultural radio offer of Milan described above leads to a reflection on the impact that migration flows can have on the hosting country in terms of offers of products, information, and entertainment services:

- There are market segments (which in a city like Milan have become relevant because of their size) with different information needs (Fiorio et al., 2007; Napolitano and Visconti, 2008; Pires and Stanton, 2005) with respect to those satisfied by the mainstream information offer: on the one hand, the communities of foreigners who settle in Italy and do not identify themselves with the often stereotyped representation of local traditional media (MAKNO, 2005) and, on the other, the Italians interested in listening to the voice of foreigners. The decision to address one or the other segment forms profoundly different markets and equally specific offer models, both present in the Milanese scenario.

- Radio satisfies these information needs by positioning itself midway between television (necessarily generalist and mainly in Italian) and the press (often Community-specific, with information and service objectives, normally in the community language). The difficulties linked to the “community” strategy are mainly related to the programmes broadcast on stations which have a national catchment area; indeed, at a national level, immigrant communities are “scattered” across the area in a fragmented and non-homogeneous way (Maneri and Meli, 2007). This critical aspect results in the need to balance community logic with generalist logic to obtain a product with greater potential in terms of audience and the possibility of making programmes appealing to advertisers. In a city like Milan, characterised by foreign communities of suitable dimensions, the development of community programmes offered by provincial or regional stations is instead possible. From
this point of view, it is surprising to discover that in Milan there is no radio product addressed to the Egyptian community, that is a very significant community in the city.

- Programmes take place on a weekly basis and favour the “debate” format and the cultural genre. The overall multicultural programme schedule seems very diversified from the point of view of genres and formats. This diversity is closely related to the flexibility and dynamism of the medium which allows programmes that constantly alternate different genres (Fenati and Scaglioni, 2002). For radio stations that address foreign communities, the availability of different broadcasting platforms (internet or satellite) in addition to the radio leads to an extension of the coverage to reach listeners beyond the radio catchment areas and national borders. This internationalisation process is often mixed with prevalently local dynamics that define the production and coverage of the radio output to produce a product which is local and global at the same time.

- Multicultural radio projects are characterised by a strong involvement of presenters and editorial staff and by a strong identification with the programme; even though the programmes have a variety of purposes, clear moral and solidarity values are common to all. The great majority of the work carried out in editorial offices is voluntary and is possible thanks to the support of associations and organisations which are often the managerial and financial reference point for these initiatives. Unlike what happens at a national level (COSPE, 2002; Maneri and Meli, 2007), none of the programmes analysed can rely on funding from local bodies; the main financial resources are volunteer work and self-financing. Weakness in the financial structure is a common feature of these radio products.

- As of today, revenues from advertising are almost irrelevant in the budget of the programmes considered; this is consistent with the radio scenario found all over Italy (COSPE, 2002; Maneri and Meli, 2007). This critical element is linked to the characteristics of the radio advertising market, since advertisers negotiate with stations based on the average data provided by Audiradio, which do not give details on the actual audience of each programme, but refer to fifteen-minute intervals on a weekly basis.

At this point it should be remembered that the main characteristics that distinguish the multicultural media offer from the mainstream one are the audience, made up of a reference ethnic/continental community, and the special relationship established between the medium and this audience. “Most ethnic minority services appear to regard the audience as a community which they see as essential to work with rather than speak to. Mainstream media tend to regard the audience as something with which to establish contact, but not to the point of declaring even so much as a limited partnership” (Browne, 2005: 113).

The audience is also the crux determining the possible development paths of the multicultural media offer, as well as a series of issues linked to the encounter with diversity. These paths are undeniably closely linked to the perspective from which the foreign audience is seen. The result of the process will differ considerably depending on whether it is the logic of the audience that prevails, as described by Browne (2005) and taken up again by Maneri and Meli (2007), or that of the market.

Today, these two attitudes are both present in the Italian media scenario.

On the one hand, as we have seen, companies are more and more interested in the new market represented by foreign citizens (Fiorio et al., 2007; Napolitano and Visconti, 2008; Pires and Stanton, 2005). There is no doubt that economic and profit opportunities have stimulated the growth of the multicultural sector (COSPE, 2002), however this phenomenon has remained limited to a specific offer without significantly affecting that of the mainstream media (Binotto and Martino, 2004). From this perspective, growth opportunities are closely linked to the
development of product advertising, which has already seen the success of a single leader in the sector (Etnocommunication Group) that considerably limited market space for small editors (Maneri and Meli, 2007). This is added to the fact that the profit restraints and profit orientation imposed by the market will force an enlargement of the reference public, thereby affecting the nature and significant identity characterisation which mark multicultural media initiatives (Browne, 2005).

This perspective is in contrast with the logic of the audience meant as the reference community: to serve and with whom the programme should be developed, which is what characterises the majority of media initiatives designed for foreigners. Also this development path will have crucial implications: first of all, the economic feasibility of the initiatives.

Right now, it is difficult to define whether the offer of multicultural contents is destined to favour inclusion and integration or to develop in parallel to the mainstream offer. Much will depend on the behaviour not only of operators and multicultural advertising dealers, but also of the companies offering mainstream products and services.

A fundamental consideration is that these two perspectives are not only two alternative configurations of the media offer addressed to foreigners, but they are also, and above all, two different worlds in terms of content. Communication and information are pillars of the process of public opinion and democratic development. Cultural integration implies training and redefining public opinion spaces (Parekh, 2004): the first step towards the recognition of diversity lies in the opening up and expansion of these spaces to the “other” (Amin, 2002).

Multicultural media in this sense are an expression of this opening: they are the place of expression of cultural community in the sphere of public opinion (Maneri and Meli, 2007); places where identity boundaries are reconstructed, discussed and re-imagined at the same time (Karanfil, 2008).

The importance of this new phenomenon lies in the public sphere opening up to new voices, to which traditional media too can refer (Georgiou, 2005). This opening up does not only imply the re-definition of the boundaries of the public sphere, but also a new, less “mediated” method of access: depending on the proximity of the media to the target community, readers and listeners actively participate in the creation of the product entering the public space directly.

Social inclusion is a project of differentiated communication (Kymlicka, 1995). The multicultural media offer represents an important element for a first welcome for immigrants (especially as a first source of information) and can be a first step towards the construction of a polyphonic society, where different nationalities enjoy the same right of citizenship.
References


